

Minutes

Greater Dayton RTA Board of Trustees Public Board Meeting

June 5, 2018

- Trustees: Adrienne L. Heard, President
Sharon Hairston, Vice President
Vince Corrado
Franz Hoge
Sharon Howard (arrived at 3:04 p.m.)
John Lumpkin
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson
- Excused: Belinda Matthews-Stenson
- Staff: Mark Donaghy, Chief Executive Officer
Chris Cole, Chief Operating Officer
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall, Co. LPA
Cathy Garner, Sr. Executive Administrative Assistant
Bob Ruzinsky, Chief Capital Officer
Mary Stanforth, Chief Financial Officer
- Others: Interested citizens (see attached sheet)

Call Meeting to Order

Ms. Heard called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. A quorum was present and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Ms. Heard led attendees in reciting the Pledge of Allegiance.

Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority

4 S. Main Street Dayton, OH 45402 • 937-425-8400 P • 937-425-8416 F • www.iriderta.org

ROLL CALL

Roll call was taken:

Mr. Corrado	Yes	Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Hairston	Yes	Ms. Matthews-Stenson	Excused
Ms. Heard	Yes	Mr. Weckesser	Yes
Mr. Hoge	Yes	Mr. Williamson	Yes
Ms. Howard	Excused		

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA

Ms. Heard stated Greater Dayton RTA (RTA) By-Laws require Board approval of today’s Meeting Agenda. Ms. Heard explained the Agenda was mailed in advance, however, since that time one change is required. Ms. Heard stated New Business Item #2 - RTA’s Facilities Code of Conduct and Rules of the Road will be added to today’s Agenda.

MOTION MADE by Ms. Hairston and SECONDED by Mr. Hoge to APPROVE today’s Board Meeting Agenda as amended to include New Business Item #2 - RTA’s Facilities Code of Conduct and Rules of the Road.

MOTION CARRIED by voice vote.

Ayes: Seven

Nays: None

APPROVAL OF MAY 1, 2018 BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Ms. Heard asked if anyone requests a reading of the minutes or if there are any corrections to the minutes? Upon hearing no requests or corrections, Ms. Heard DECLARED ACCEPTANCE of the May 1, 2018 Board Meeting Minutes.

Ms. Howard arrived at 3:04 p.m.

FINANCE/PERSONNEL COMMITTEE REPORT (JOHN LUMPKIN)

Mr. Lumpkin stated the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees met for a jointly held meeting on May 15th, 2018 and as a result the Finance/Personnel Committee is

recommending two (2) Action Items for approval by the Board of Trustees.

ACTION ITEM #2 –INSURANCE BROKER SERVICES

The purpose of this procurement is to obtain a broker for all property and casualty insurance for the RTA and to administer the Property and Casualty Risk Management Program. The lines of insurance RTA currently has in force include: Property, General Liability, Auto Liability, Auto Physical Damage, Crime, Excess Liability, Public Officials & EPLI, Property Terrorism, Faithful Performance Bond, Workers Compensation, Felonious Assault, and Cyber Liability. Premiums totaled approximately \$1.65 million in 2017.

Mr. Lumpkin stated this procurement is being brought to the Board at this time as a broker must be selected to design and market such policies of insurance as may be required by RTA and negotiate rates and coverages. This procurement is in line with RTA's core value of good Stewardship of Financial Resources.

Marsh & McLennan Agency, LLC, is RTA's current service provider. Marsh & McLennan has the stability, public sector experience, and resources to provide the high level of service that RTA requires, and they were the lowest priced proposer. They take an aggressive stance on subrogation, recovering nearly \$100,000 per year for RTA. Marsh & McLennan Agencies, is a subsidiary of Marsh & McLennan Companies. Marsh & McLennan Companies was ranked 1st among the world's 100 largest insurance brokers in 2017 based on 2016 revenues. This gives Marsh & McLennan Agency a strong market presence with many local, regional, and national carriers and enhances their access to market research and benchmarking capabilities.

The proposed pricing is the same as the current contract.

MOTION MADE by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston to AWARD a contract to Marsh & McLennan Agency, LLC, for insurance broker services for a four-year period in the total amount of \$330,000 plus \$82,500 for one option year, for a GRAND TOTAL amount of \$412,500. This procurement will be funded 100% through Local funds.

MOTION CARRIED by voice vote.

Ayes: Seven

Nays: None

Abstain: One – Mr. Hoge

ACTION ITEM #3 – ROOFING OF SELECTED SECTIONS 901 SOUTH LUDLOW STREET

Mr. Lumpkin stated the purpose of this procurement is for RTA to contract with qualified contractors for roofing of selected sections at the 901 South Ludlow Street building. This project is consistent with RTA's core values of Safety, Stewardship, and Quality Service as we demonstrate our commitment to maintain facilities in a state of good repair and to make our customers a priority.

The successful contractor will provide needed replacements and repairs to selected sections of the roof at 901 South Ludlow Street. The contractor will be responsible for all labor, materials, and required permits necessary to complete the project.

MOTION MADE by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Mr. Corrado to AWARD a contract to Nations Roof for a total of \$399,490 plus a 15% contingency of \$59,924 to cover unknown items that may surface upon removal of existing roofing for a TOTAL AWARD up to \$459,414. This procurement will be funded 80% through Federal capital grant funds.

MOTION CARRIED by voice vote.

Ayes: Eight

Nays: None

Discussion Items to Mention

February 2018 Sales Tax Update

Subsequent to our meeting, Ms. Stanforth reported February 2018 receipts are \$35,000 or 1.2% lower than budget.

Year-to-date receipts are \$39,000 or 0.7% *lower* than budget. Staff will continue to monitor and report Sales Tax Receipts on a monthly basis.

April 2018 Financial Statements

RTA's April 2018 Net Loss after Local Depreciation is \$95,618 compared to Budgeted Net Income of \$260,687. Operating revenues were \$39,402 (5.4%) below budget. Operating expenses, excluding depreciation, were \$198,542 (3.8%) over budget. RTA local depreciation expense was \$8,928 (4.8%) over budget. Finally, non-operating revenues (expenses) were \$109,433 (2.2%) under budget.

RTA's Year-to-Date (YTD) Actual Net Loss after Local Depreciation is \$426,241 compared to YTD Budgeted Net Loss of \$410,820. Operating revenues were \$11,132 (0.4%) above budget. Operating expenses, excluding depreciation, were \$296,255 (1.4%) under budget. RTA local depreciation expense was \$15,635 (2.0%) under budget. Finally, non-operating revenues (expenses) were \$338,443 (1.8%) under budget.

The details and variance explanations associated with the financial statements are included in today's Board Meeting Package.

PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT (SHARON HOWARD)

Ms. Howard stated the Planning Committee has no Action Items to present today, however, there are important informational items to share.

Ms. Howard stated Mr. Policicchio provided a summary document of recent activities in the Customer and Business Development Department. Highlights from this month's report include updates on February's service change, including customer adoption of the new fare structure. Mr. Policicchio reported that bus pass usage, since implementation of the new fare structure, rose from 64% to 82%, while cash usage decreased from 24% to 11%. In addition, updates were provided regarding the Connect On-Demand program. To date, the program has been successful and customer access has greatly increased with over 90% of all customers transferring to and from fixed route services.

Highlights also included RTA’s involvement in this year’s Rebuilding Together Dayton program. On April 28, a group of 21 RTA employees, along with their friends and family, volunteered from 8 a.m. to dinner time assisting a homeowner on Smith Street in Dayton’s Carillon Neighborhood. Volunteers helped to make safety and aesthetic upgrades to her home. This was the sixth year RTA “sponsored” a home in the annual “Rebuilding Day” event.

Ms. Howard gave a preview for this summer’s Read On RTA reading program. The program started June 4th and will run through August 10th. During the 10-week program, the RTA will hand out thousands of new and gently used books to children across the Dayton area, with bookshelves stationed in all five RTA transit centers. The program kicked off this year with a successful rider donation day on Friday, May 25, 2018. That day, about 300 riders donated at least one book to the program, and in exchange received a free Day Bus Pass.

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S (CEO) REPORT

Mr. Donaghy commented that he had a few informational items to share. Mr. Donaghy stated that major construction projects in the Dayton area have a significant impact on RTA’s daily on-time performance. Mr. Donaghy stated that Mr. Caldwell is doing a great job of keeping the buses on schedule!

Mr. Donaghy stated that in previous Committee meetings Mr. Policicchio discussed RTA’s latest endeavor entitled “What Drives You?” Mr. Donaghy stated that during the next few weeks internal Staff will learn more about this program and how it affects them. Mr. Donaghy commented RTA will then showcase all of its services, which promote mobility across the Dayton region, with “The RTA Experience” day on Friday, June 29, 2018.

The RTA is home to many mobility options that connect people to jobs, medical appointments, grocery shopping and other needs through a variety of services, many of which provide instant “on-demand” options. The Agency is proud to transport more than 30,000 daily riders. Those riders are workers, students, veterans, seniors, disabled individuals and others across the Greater Dayton region who choose

from a variety of RTA mobility options that best serves their need at a fair cost. The goal is to provide RTA customers and our community a choice in travel throughout the region.

Mr. Donaghy stated that Dayton citizens may see an old antique bus on the road tomorrow, as RTA received a special request from a group called The Bus History Association. Mr. Donaghy commented that there are about 75 attendees who will be staying in Dayton multiple days visiting Greater Dayton RTA, Cincinnati and Columbus Transit Centers. RTA is rolling out historic fleet unit #110, which is a Canadian Bus. This bus will be on the street most of the day tomorrow along with RTA's NexGen. The group consist of members from as far away as Toronto, Canada.

In closing, Mr. Donaghy asked the Board to consider a request to approve a second Action Item under New Business regarding the RTA Facilities Code of Conduct and Rules of the Road.

Ms. Heard asked if a Board Member's presence is required at any of the events?

Mr. Donaghy replied no, as the group will be on a very tight schedule. This was for informational purposes only, as the guests' primary focus will be on facilities and bus tours.

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS ITEM #1 – BUS WASH SYSTEMS

Mr. Donaghy stated RTA solicited proposals for Bus Wash Systems. This procurement is consistent with the core values of Quality Service and Stewardship by ensuring a clean vehicle on a daily basis to our customers and by managing our resources efficiently and responsibly.

The intent of this procurement is to replace two (2) bus wash systems at 600 Longworth Street and one (1) system at 601 Longworth Street. The RTA washes about 225 buses each night which requires a heavy duty, dependable and user friendly system. The bus wash system must also be able to accommodate all of our various vehicle types

including Trolleys, Nexgens, Diesels, Paratransit and Automobiles.

On December 6, 2017, proposals were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News and Transit Talent. Requests for proposals were sent to thirteen (13) firms. At 2:00 p.m., on January 11, 2018, four (4) proposals were received. The proposals were reviewed by the Evaluation Committee based upon the following criteria:

Evaluation Criteria

- Qualifications, Experience and References
- Project Work Program and Schedule
- Warranty Duration and Coverage; Technical Support
- Qualifications of Personnel
- Reasonableness of Cost
- Quality of Proposal Preparation

Pricing was also requested for a quarterly manufacturer's inspection for the purpose of having the manufacturer check the bus wash system during the first warranty year and to provide preventive maintenance oversight to our team. It will also benefit maintenance staff by having access to a factory representative, on a quarterly basis, to answer any maintenance related questions. The pricing for the inspection is \$6,100 per year for all three (3) bus wash systems for a total of \$18,300. Bus Wash Systems will be funded with 80% Federal capital grant funds and the quarterly manufacturer's inspection with Local funds.

MOTION MADE by Mr. Hoge and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin to AWARD a contract to Westmatic Corporation for three (3) Bus Wash Systems at \$351,221 each for a total of \$1,053,663, plus a 7% Contingency of \$73,756 for unforeseen issues, plus \$18,300 for the quarterly manufacturer's inspection for a grand total of \$1,145,719.

Mr. Hoge asked Mr. Donaghy what bus transit systems presently use this washing system?

Mr. Donaghy deferred to Mr. Daron Brown to reply to Mr. Hoge's question.

Mr. Brown stated that Dayton is unique because RTA has Trolley Buses. Mr. Brown stated that there are very few

transit systems in the Country that have trolleys. Mr. Brown went on to say that if the other transit facilities do have washing systems that they have a different system than what RTA is proposing. Mr. Brown stated that Westmatic Corporation has similar or other types of bus work throughout the Country, such as Atlanta, Texas, and New York. They have been in business for about thirty (30) years.

Mr. Hoge asked if RTA has checked with Toronto to see what their experience has been with Westmatic Corporation?

Mr. Brown replied yes! RTA Staff recently visited their facility and while there met with their train station personnel and learned that Westmatic received great reviews on their system, follow-up on maintenance, and their warranty.

Mr. Hoge asked what is the warranty period?

Mr. Brown replied that the warranty covers 2-years parts and labor.

Mr. Hoge asked how old is RTA's present system?

Mr. Donaghy replied about 40 years old, however the bus wash system in the 601 building is slightly newer. Mr. Brown commented one of the best features about this system is that out of all of the other systems, this manufacturer only had to do a conversion to wash RTA trolleys without any further modifications.

Mr. Williamson asked if there can be a variety of types of buses/vehicles going through the bus wash system?

Mr. Brown replied yes. Mr. Brown stated any of the RTA vehicles currently on site can utilize the system without any issue. Mr. Brown added that when the vehicle pulls into the bus wash system, the machine will recognize what type of vehicle it is and wash and adjust accordingly.

Mr. Williamson asked what is the life expectancy of this system?

Mr. Brown stated fifteen (15) to twenty (20) years or longer if properly maintained.

MOTION CARRIED by voice vote.

Ayes: Eight

Nays: None

NEW BUSINESS ITEM #2 – RTA’s FACILITIES CODE OF CONDUCT AND RULES OF THE ROAD

Mr. Donaghy stated that this week it was brought to his attention by the Dayton Police Department that they would be unable to enforce one of our longstanding behavior rules regarding the failure to properly cover a person’s body and undergarments. Their concern was the wording of our Facilities Code.

Staff asked the Board to adopt a revised Facilities Code of Conduct and Rules of the Road in June, 2017 as a result of state law changes related to open/concealed carry of firearms. At that time the versions used as templates were outdated. The templates were not the 2016 approved versions of either document.

Given the nature of this error time is of the essence, and as a result, Mr. Donaghy requests APPROVAL of the 2018 revised versions of RTA’s Facilities Code of Conduct and Rules of the Road. Mr. Donaghy attached copies with changes highlighted. Mr. Donaghy apologized for RTA’s failure to catch this error.

MOTION MADE by Ms. Hairston and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser to ADOPT the 2018 Revised RTA Facilities Code of Conduct and Rules of the Road.

MOTION CARRIED by voice vote.

Ayes: Eight

Nays: None

Mr. Donaghy communicated that a legal notice will be published regarding the revised documents.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Sandra Mae Smothers – 6217 N. Main Street – Apt. #124- Dayton, Ohio. Ms. Smothers stated that some Project Mobility drivers have bad attitudes and are not friendly when customers are boarding their vehicles.

Ms. Ruby Thompson – 729 W. Grand Avenue - Apt. #142 – Dayton, Ohio. Ms. Thompson asked if you make a one way trip using Project Mobility are you, the customer, required to make a round trip?

Mr. Donaghy replied no.

Ms. Thompson stated since her reporting this matter that the matter had been properly addressed and rectified. Ms. Thompson thanked everyone for their follow-up.

Ms. Mary Miller – 229 Colgate Avenue – Dayton, Ohio. Ms. Miller. Ms. Miller asked that the “shower chair” being used to lift passengers onto the Project Mobility vehicles be revisited by Staff to see if there is another chair that can be used for that purpose. Ms. Miller also stated that she had another issue with a driver at Dixie Dental. Ms. Miller did contact Staff and the situation was rectified.

Mr. Donaghy commented that he stands by RTA’s policy that at this time the device referred to as the “shower chair” remains to be the safest when Project Mobility customers are boarding the vehicle. Mr. Donaghy stated that in terms of the incident that took place on the 21st with an operator and Ms. Miller, the operator was indeed wrong in his actions. The operator was subsequently disciplined. Mr. Donaghy stated that there was no excuse for how the operator acted.

**BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS
- ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Ms. Heard confirmed upcoming meetings have been cancelled due to no anticipated Action being required, however, if an emergency arises, any of those dates may be chosen as alternative meeting dates. The Jointly held RTA Finance, Personnel and Planning Committees meeting on June 19th, RTA Board of Trustees meeting on July 3rd, and Investment Advisory Committee meeting on July 19th, have been cancelled.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

None

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION MADE by Ms. Howard and SECONDED Mr. Lumpkin to ADJOURN the meeting.

MOTION CARRIED by voice vote.

Ayes: Eight

Nays: None

The meeting adjourned at 3:42 p.m.

ATTEST



Adrienne L. Heard
President
RTA Board of Trustees



Mary K. Stanforth
Secretary/Treasurer
RTA Board of Trustees

cg